

Security Freeze Bill Commentary on Sections

Section 1 Definitions			
Section/Subsection	Explanation	Issue	Comment
Sub (2) Consumer reporting agency	Uses the text from the federal definition in 15 U.S.C. Sec. 1681a(f)	Some say just to reference 15 USC etc.	More user friendly to have text in MCA
Sub (3) Credit report	Text is synonymous with consumer report as defined in 15 U.S.C. 1681a(d)(1). Could use term “consumer report” throughout instead of “credit report”.	Definition of consumer report includes more than a credit report. ChoicePoint notes that credit reports are a subsection of consumer reports.	ChoicePoint OK with language and definition if exclusion (14)(n) is included because not all contacts to CRAs and others are for credit. Some are for other purposes.
Sub (5) Proper identification	Says “information sufficient to verify identity”.	Is vague good? Could provide examples of ID that could be used	Some states say CRA may require additional info: CO, IL, KY, NC, TX, WI
Sub (7) Security freeze	Prohibits releasing “all or any part of the consumer’s credit report or credit score...”	Some states say specifically for extension of credit, e.g. KS, KY, TX, UT	Not referencing extension of credit means inclusion of phone, utility accounts and employment or other contacts. States that do not reference extension of credit include: CA, LA, ME, NC, NJ, WA, WI EAIC chose May 12 the inclusive approach.
Section 2 Placement of freeze			
Sub (1) regular or certified mail	Dispute over any kind of method other than certified	Most states say certified mail	EAIC said May 12 to allow electronic
Sub (2) electronic	Quicker method	Some states say other methods allowed	NJ requires, and wants within 15 minutes. UT requires electronic method chosen by CRAs and by phone
Section 3. Consumer reporting agency duties			
Sub (1) : --Placement no later than 5 days	Most states say within 5-days: CA, CO, CT, IL, KS, LA, ME, NV, NJ, NC, SD, TX, WA, WI 10 days = KY	Not an issue	
Sub (2) procedure for ID theft victim	Within 24 hours	Old draft said victim of ID theft “and” who has an ID theft passport	Problem with delay in getting ID theft passport. Fee section says ID theft victim can get free as can someone

			notified of security breach. Requiring ID theft passport would place burden on victim not on <i>potential</i> victim.
Sub (3) Confirmation 5 days (AG) 10 days (CDIA)	5 days confirm =NJ 10 days = CA, CO, CT, IL, KS, KY, LA, ME, NV, NC, SD, TX, WA, WI		✓ Need to choose on confirmation timing
Sub (3) similar device along with password or PIN	CDIA has requested wording for “similar device”	Consumers Union questions what this is.	Not aware that any other state includes this ✓ Need to choose
Section/Subsection	Explanation	Issue	Comment
Section 4. Temporary lift			
For specific time or specific party			EAIC said in May to allow both options
Point of contact designated by CRA	CDIA-requested language	Language used by: CA, CO, CT, IL, KS, KY, LA, ME, NC, SD, VT, WA, WI	✓ Need to choose
Timing of lift (thaw)	No later than 3 business days or at earliest time generally provided by another state, whichever is earlier (earliest time language requested by AG)	3 business days: CA, CO, CT, IL, KS, KY, LA, ME, NJ, NV, NC, SD, TX, UT, VT, WA, WI	NJ and UT also require earlier ✓ Need to choose
Procedure for lifting	Make available by telephone, fax, electronic means within one year of effective date. Gives CRAs time to develop.	Most states say “may” or allow method developed by CRAs. NV, NJ, TX have alternate methods	✓ Need to choose
Section 5. Removal of freeze by Consumer Reporting Agency			
Notification	AG version says CRA to notify consumer in writing at least 5 business days prior to removal of freeze.	Not in other states	✓ Need to choose
Section 6. Third-party contacts			
Sub (1) Application can be treated as incomplete w/ freeze	Common approach	No issue	
Sub (2) Notification of consumer when attempts made for credit use, unless for account review	Proposed by AG	CDIA says this is unique.	✓ Need to choose
Section 7. Removal of freeze by consumer			
Point of contact, device (as in Sec. 4)	Requested by CDIA		✓ Need to choose

Section/Subsection	Explanation	Issue	Comment
Section 8. Notice of rights			
Pin, password or device	CDIA suggests “device”	Is this mentioned elsewhere?	✓ Need to choose
Shorter time frame if electronic	EAIC has said electronic notification can be used.	This would match electronic option	✓ Need to choose
Section 9. Exclusions			
Sub (7) adds words “for use of a credit report for purpose of prescreening”	Requested by CDIA	Not sure what impact is	✓ Need to choose
Sub (12) Exempts insurance industry	Work group OK’d exclusion.	Some exclude: KY, NC, NH, OK, SD, VT (property-casualty), WI	Others do not: CA, CO, CT, IL, KS, LA, ME
Sub (14 - formerly n) excludes database with information on items other than credit, including criminal records, tenant or employment screening, fraud prevention or detection, personal loss history	Repeats some of other exclusions but apparently intended for those information brokers that work with CRAs . Not all activities are covered under FCRA. Consumers Union suggests adding language to address persons not covered by FCRA and also suggests using words “solely” and entirely because otherwise databases that are a mix of credit and other information could be excluded, creating loophole.	Florida uses solely Kansas says solely and for FCRA purposes. Kentucky uses solely.	✓ Need to choose whether to add (14) and, if so, whether to add words solely and entirely as suggested by Consumers Union and reference that coverage is for people not covered by FCRA.
Section 10. Fees			
Sub (1) Requires fee except for victim (under Sub 2)	States vary on what they charge: Up to \$10 fee for CA, CO (on 2 nd & subsequent freeze), CT, KY, LA, ME, NC, OK, SD, VT, WI. Some states add CPI increase. CDIA says fee is for administrative set-up and costs.	Other – NV charges \$15, NY \$5 for 2 nd & subsequent freeze, TX \$8, UT “reasonable”	EAIC chose \$10 at May 12 meeting. Fee would apply to each CRA.
Sub (2) Language says free to victim who has submitted a valid police report or been notified of a security breach.	Requiring a police report may impose a greater burden on victim than on potential {breach} victim, who does not have to provide a police report (see above, Sec. 3, sub (2) Language bolded makes it easier for victim to submit proof.	All states offer free to victims.	Work group recommended language that would make it easier to include complaint to police & investigative report ✓ Need to choose: Does victim need to show they are victim? If so, what type of proof?

Section/Subsection	Explanation	Issue	Comment
Sub (3) Fee for obtaining password, PIN (or other device)	Procedure for charging consumer if they misplace, forget password. Requested by AG. Device language is CDIA.	Not sure there is an issue. At least one other state uses language.	✓ Need to choose
Section 11. Penalties			
(1) Person who fails to comply with freeze	Actual damages of consumer or damages of not less than \$100 or more than \$1,000 plus punitive damages and court costs	AG suggested both injunctive relief and civil penalty of up to \$10,000 for each violation plus damages under other civil laws	EAIC chose the actual damages or \$100 to \$1000 range at May 12 meeting (version offered by CDIA)
(2) Person who falsely obtains report, requests a freeze or a thaw or removal	Actual damages sustained by consumer reporting agency or \$1,000, whichever is greater.		
(3) Person negligently complying with requirements	Actual damages of consumer and court costs. Harassment, bad faith provisions.		
Section 14. Effective date			
Proposed for July 2007	Some people prefer effective date farther in future to let Consumer Reporting Agencies develop response system.		✓ Need to choose