

Montana State Legislature

Exhibit Number: 21

This exhibit exceeds 10-page maximum; therefore only a small portion of the exhibit is scanned for your research. The original exhibit is on file at the Montana Historical Society and may be viewed there

SENATE ~~2005~~ *Judiciary*
EXHIBIT NO. *21*
DATE: *3-4-05*
BILL NO. *HB 332*

**DIAGNOSING THE AILMENT--
PRESCRIBING THE CURE**

**Final Report of the SJR 32 Subcommittee on
Medical Liability Insurance**

Rep. George Golie, Presiding Officer
Sen. Duane Grimes, Vice Presiding Officer



PO Box 201706
Helena, MT 59620-1706
PHONE: (406) 444-3064
FAX: (406) 444-3036
<http://leg.state.mt.us/>

The SJR 32 Subcommittee on Medical Liability Insurance

Senator Duane Grimes (R)
Vice Chairman, Clancy

Representative George Golie (D)
Chairman, Great Falls

Senator John Cobb (R), Augusta

Representative Roy Brown (R)
Billings

Senator Brent Cromley (D), Billings

Representative Kathleen Galvin-halcro
(D), Great Falls

Senator Debbie Shea (D), Butte

Representative Don Roberts (R),
Billings

Legislative Services Division Staff to the Subcommittee

David D. Bohyer, Research Director
John MacMaster, Staff Attorney
Dawn Field, Secretary

September 2004

Acknowledgments

The Subcommittee thanks the Montana Hospital Association, the Montana Medical Association, the Montana Trial Lawyers Association, the Montana Defense Trial Lawyers Association, Deaconess Billings Clinic, the Mansfield Health Education Center at St. Vincent's Hospital (Billings), the Office of the Insurance Commissioner, The Doctors Company, the Utah Medical Insurance Association, and the numerous physicians, hospital administrators, and other stakeholders who provided information and testimony to the Subcommittee. Your contributions were meaningful and your participation essential to the Subcommittee's success.

The Subcommittee also recognizes and thanks Dawn Field for her dedication to faithfully recording the Subcommittee's activities, attending to the Subcommittee's needs for copies, vote counts, and the like, and for generally supporting the Subcommittee's efforts. She has been an unsung hero in this endeavor.

Table of Contents

	<i>Page</i>
CHAPTER 1: Beginning at the End	1
Background	1
Introduction	2
Recommendations	3
Recommendation 1: Insurance Reform: LC 5000	4
Recommendation 2: Tort Reform: LC 5001	5
Recommendation 3: Tort Reform: LC 5002	5
Recommendation 4: Tort Reform: LC 5004	6
Recommendation 5: Tort Reform: LC 5005	7
Recommendation 6: Tort Reform: LC 5007	8
Recommendation 7: Tort Reform: LC 5008	8
Recommendation 8: Insurance Reform: LC 5009	10
Recapitulation of Recommendations	11
CHAPTER 2: Assessing the Medical Liability Terrain	13
Nature and scope of the Montana medical liability insurance crisis	14
A broader view	14
Laying a foundation	15
The insurance component of the crisis	16
A cost crisis	16
An availability crisis	17
The severity of the crisis in Montana	18
Factors contributing to increased premium rates	19
The medical system component of the crisis	22
The legal system component of the crisis	23
Differences of experience and opinion	24
Searching for causal factors	27
CHAPTER 3: Examining Montana's and Other States Medical Liability Laws'	32
PART 1: Montana Medical Liability Law and Reforms	36
Statute of Limitations: 27-2-205, MCA	37
Limits on Noneconomic Damages: 25-9-411, MCA	38
Collateral Source Rule: 27-1-308, MCA	39
Joint and Several Liability: 27-1-703, et seq., MCA	40
Periodic Payments: 25-9-412, MCA	41
Pretrial Screening: Title 27, chapter 6, MCA	42
Expert Witness Rules: Title 26, chapter 10, part VII, Rule 702, MCA	43
Attorney Fees	44
Contributory or Comparative Negligence or Fault: 27-1-702, MCA	45
Vicarious Liability or Ostensible Agency: 28-10-103, MCA	46
Prejudgment Interest: 27-1-210, MCA	47
Summary of Montana Medical Liability Laws and Tort Reforms	47
PART 2: Policy Alternatives	48
Certificate of Merit	49
Screening Panels	51
Specialized "Medical Malpractice" Courts	52

Table of Contents

	<u>Page</u>
Expert Witnesses	55
Jury Education	55
Variability of Jury Awards	56
Alternative Dispute Resolution	57
Enterprise Liability	58
Selective No-fault Liability	59
Clinical Practice Guidelines	60
Insurance Market Interventions	61
Insurance Reform: California's Proposition 103	64
Other Potential Reforms	66
The Specific Case of Wisconsin and Medical Liability	68
What is the Wisconsin HCLPCA?	68
Who is affected by the provisions of the Act?	70
Why was the program created?	71
How did the program create additional malpractice insurance capacity? ..	71
What level of insurance coverage does the program provide?	72
How does this program stabilize the medical malpractice marketplace? ..	72
How is the Wisconsin PCF capitalized?	72
Does the Wisconsin program affect the price of malpractice insurance? ..	73
Is the program simply a bonus for special interests?	74
How financially healthy or stable is the PCF?	74
Are the citizens of Wisconsin on the hook to pay claims?	75
Is the Wisconsin approach unique?	75
What options have other states pursued?	76
The LC 5000 Option	77
Summary of Montana MMLI Law, Other State's MMLI Laws, and Options	78
 CHAPTER 4: A Measure of Success	 80
The rising cost of liability insurance for health care providers	81
Medical Liability Statutes	82
Declining Competition From Fewer Providers	82
Explosion in Malpractice Claims	83
Explosion in Jury Awards	84
The insurance cycle	86
Declining investment income	87
Linking rising MMLI premiums and rising costs of medical care	88
The effects of MMLI premiums on medical practice	91
Strategies to increase the availability of affordable liability insurance	92
Resolving liability claims outside of courts	93
Summary and Conclusion	94
Appendix A: Recommended Draft Legislation	
Appendix B: The National Conference of State Legislatures' Summary of State Medical Liability Laws	
Appendix C: The American Medical Association's Summary of State Medical Liability Laws	
Appendix D: Summary of California Proposition 103	