

LEGAL REVIEW NOTE

LC#: LC2083, To Legal Review Copy, as of February 11, 2015

Short Title: Revise graduation requirements to include civics examination

Attorney Reviewer: Todd Everts/Laura Sankey

Date: February 13, 2015

CONFORMITY WITH STATE AND FEDERAL CONSTITUTIONS

*This review is intended to inform the bill draft requestor of potential constitutional conformity issues that may be raised by the bill as drafted. This review **IS NOT** dispositive of the issue of constitutional conformity and the general rule as repeatedly stated by the Montana Supreme Court is that an enactment of the Legislature is presumed to be constitutional unless it is proven beyond a reasonable doubt that the enactment is unconstitutional. See Alexander v. Bozeman Motors, Inc., 356 Mont. 439, 234 P.3d 880 (2010); Eklund v. Wheatland County, 351 Mont. 370, 212 P.3d 297 (2009); St. v. Pyette, 337 Mont. 265, 159 P.3d 232 (2007); and Elliott v. Dept. of Revenue, 334 Mont. 195, 146 P.3d 741 (2006).*

As required pursuant to section 5-11-112(1)(c), MCA, it is the Legislative Services Division's statutory responsibility to conduct "legal review of draft bills". The comments noted below regarding conformity with state and federal constitutions are provided to assist the Legislature in making its own determination as to the constitutionality of the bill. The comments are based on an analysis of jurisdictionally relevant state and federal constitutional law as applied to the bill. The comments are not written for the purpose of influencing whether the bill should become law but are written to provide information relevant to the Legislature's consideration of this bill. The comments are not a formal legal opinion and are not a substitute for the judgment of the judiciary, which has the authority to determine the constitutionality of a law in the context of a specific case.

Legal Reviewer Comments:

LC2083, as drafted, may raise a potential constitutional conformity issue associated with Article X of the Montana Constitution. Article X, section 9(3)(a), creates a "board of public education to exercise general supervision over the public school system and other such public educational institutions as may be assigned by law." The Montana Supreme Court has held that the Legislature does not have the ability to remove duties from the Board of Public Education that fall under the Board's directive to generally supervise public educational systems. See *Board of Public Education v. Judge*, 167 Mont. 261 (1975), holding that the Legislature could not transfer responsibility for vocational education from the Board of Public Education to the State Board of Education because the Legislature did not have the authority to alter the structure of the three

constitutional boards of education where the State Board of Education was intended only to plan, coordinate, and evaluate the state's educational systems.

As drafted, section 1 of LC2083 requires the Board of Public Education adopt a specific accreditation standard requiring students to correctly answer at least 60 out of 100 questions on the civics portion of the US Citizenship and Immigration Services' naturalization test. A potential constitutional conformity issue may arise with LC2083 as drafted regarding whether these provisions conflict with the Board of Public Education's exercise of general supervision over the public school system pursuant to Article X, section 9(3)(a).

The potential constitutional conformity issue raised is whether, under the Montana Constitution, the Legislature can require the Board of Education to adopt a specific accreditation standard regarding civics testing.

Requestor Comments: