

Table 2: Medical Malpractice Insurers in Montana, by market share, with premiums earned, losses, paid claims, settlements if available for FY 2006 -08

Insurer		FY 2006						FY 2008 -- REVISED 11/16/09								
(order by market share)	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims with direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid for Cols. A&B (adding Col. C settlements)	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims with direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid in year (including payments for previous years) for all cases		
Utah Medical Ins. Assoc.		\$14,530,208	\$7,792,208	For Physicians			\$9,337,472 (\$14,242,472)	32.74%	\$14,055,590	\$3,191,653	For Physicians					
				85	30	45 (9)					104	7	4 (0)			
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			\$690 (Col. B) (nothing listed)				Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			
		53.63%		3	1	--					22.71%		4		0	1(0)
Mountain States Healthcare Reciprocal Risk Retention Group		\$8,894,136	\$4,322,985	For Physicians			\$144,139 --for direct losses pd	17.86%	\$7,737,410	minus \$1,746,406 (a)	For Physicians					
				16							20					
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			\$288,009 -- for direct losses pd				Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			
		48.60%		32							-22.57%		40			
Doctors Co., An Interinsurance Exchange		\$8,241,757	\$6,552,203	For Physicians			\$6,460,000 (\$8,700,000)	16.92%	\$7,653,470	\$1,689,837	For Physicians					
				133	10	11 (9)					--	18	19(12)			
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities							Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			
		79.50%									22.08%					
Yellowstone Insurance Exchange Risk Retention Group		\$3,494,653	\$1,388,203	For Physicians				9.37%	\$4,071,420	\$841,681	For Physicians					
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			\$362,244 - for direct losses pd				Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			
		39.72%		7	data distorted	1					20.68%		8		0	1 (6) data distorted

Insurer	FY 2006							FY 2008 -- REVISED 11/16/09						
	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims with direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid for Cols. A&B (adding Col. C settlements)	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims with direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid in year (including payments for previous years) for all cases
Columbia Casualty Co.		\$1,215,496	\$329,018	For Physicians			IBNR set aside	4.18%	\$1,682,349	\$1,080,969	For Physicians			
				0	0	0					1	1	1(1)	
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			\$1,993,679 (\$2,893,679)		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			
		27.07%		10	3	3			64.27%		9	0	0	
Preferred Professional Ins. Co.		\$1,439,894	\$943,447	For Physicians			\$2,084,703	3.58%	\$1,523,323	\$1,957,914	For Physicians			
				--	5	1(0)								
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			\$55,348 - direct loss pd in closed claims (\$105,348)		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		For Health Care Facilities			
		65.52%		--	--	0 listed (1 settled)			128.56%					
Medical Protective Co.		\$160,098	-\$254,000	For Physicians			reserves set aside	2.05%	\$595,992	\$273,000	For Physicians			
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		-	-	0 listed (1 closed w/o settlement)					Pure Direct Loss Ratio		-	
		-1.59%		For Dentists			reserves set aside		45.81%		For Dentists			
		10	-	1 (2 closed w/o settlement)	1	-					1			
Hudson Specialty Ins. Co.		\$1,033,185	\$254,229	For Physicians			nothing listed	1.89%	\$871,550	\$871,194	For Physicians			
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		2	3	1					Pure Direct Loss Ratio			
		24.61%		For Health Care Facilities			nothing listed		99.86%		For Health Care Facilities			
		1	-	-										

Insurer	FY 2006							FY 2008 -- REVISED 11/16/09						
	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims with direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid for Cols. A&B (adding Col. C settlements)	% market share	Direct premiums earned	Direct losses incurred*	Col. A = # of claims against insureds	Col. B = # of closed claims with direct loss paid	Col. C = # of lawsuits filed (# with settlements)	Total of direct losses paid in year (including payments for previous years) for all cases
Steadfast Ins Co.		\$482,399	\$358,201	For Physicians			nothing listed	1.76%	\$695,338	\$282,042	For Physicians			
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		-	-	-			Pure Direct Loss Ratio					
		74.25%		For Health Care Facilities			\$175,000 in direct losses pd		40.58%		For Health Care Facilities			
				-	-	-								
American Casualty Co of Reading PA		\$540,561	\$337,940	For Physicians			reserves set aside	1.45%	\$637,687	\$369,404	For All Other Specialties***			
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		0	0	0	\$1,176 pd in direct losses for closed claim		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		15	2	5	
		62.52%		For Registered Nurses					12	57.84%		For Registered Nurses		
				7	1	0						2	2	
Lexington Ins Co.		\$668,582	-\$188,875	For all other specialties***			0, reserves set aside	1.11%	\$740,854	-\$313,755 (a)	For All Other Specialties***			
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		1	0	0	0, reserves set aside		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		1	0	0	
		-28.25%		For Health Care Facilities					3	-42.38%		For Health Care Facilities		
				1	0	0						0	1	
NCMIC Ins Co.		\$353,290	-\$20,996	For all other specialties***			\$50,000 in direct losses pd for closed claim (\$100,000)	0.92%	\$397,105	\$231,955	For all other specialties***			
		Pure Direct Loss Ratio		3	1	3			Pure Direct Loss Ratio		6	1	4(1)	
		-5.94							58.44%					

*These numbers include accumulated claims outstanding for that fiscal year but not yet paid and for claims incurred but not reported.

**The report indicates for Yellowstone Ins. Exchange Risk Retention Group that 305,000 claims were closed and that \$10 in losses were paid out.

***Form lists physicians, osteopaths, podiatrists, dentists, optometrists, registered nurses, licensed practical nurse, health care facilities, and all other specialties.

(a) The negative number most likely refers to a recalculation by an actuary that indicates the unpaid liability booked in the previous year was more than required to pay claims (leading to a negative incurred loss).

Source: State Auditor's Reports, Market Share - by Line of Business and Montana Medical Malpractice Professional Liability Experience Report, Fiscal Years 2006 and 2008.