**Limestone West Decision Matrix**

**Objectives**

* + ***Manage the forest to promote improved health, productivity, and diversity.***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| 447 acres treated | 346 acres treated |

* + ***Capture the value of dead and dying lodgepole***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| Harvest ~560 MBF lodgepole pine | Harvest ~460 MBF lodgepole pine |

* + ***Generate revenue for the trust beneficiaries***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| Generates $307,760 based on $400MBF | Generates $276,285 based on $400MBF |

* + ***Minimize fire and safety risk imposed by current forest conditions***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| 447 acres treated | 346 acres treated |

* + ***Enhance and expand the existing transportation system to provide improved access for long-term future management of the area and fire suppression needs***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| Provides 2.81 miles administrative access road, and 6.72 miles road Prism debris closed. Allows for access to the west of Limestone drainage and the debris closed roads could be made usable in short order if necessary for fire suppression with a dozer. | Provides 2.81 miles administrative access road, and 6.32 miles road Prism debris closed. Allows for access to the west of Limestone drainage and the debris closed roads could be made usable in short order if necessary for fire suppression with a dozer. |

Both alternatives meet the objectives stated in the EIS, as would have been expected since both alternatives were designed to be selectable. As it stands there is minimal difference in how well each alternative meets the objectives.

If there had been another objective “Support for timber industry infrastructure” Alternative A would have clearly met the objective better with a 28% increase in timber product. In this case we didn’t include that objective, but perhaps we should include it in the future since the timber industry infrastructure is so critical to our ability to meet our mission and it would coordinate with our Forestry Division Goals.

**Issues**

***VEGATATION***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| 3314 MBF timber harvest  447 acres treated | 2575 MBF  346 acres treated |

***WATERSHED AND HYDROLOGY***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| 447 acres disturbed  Increased exposure due to stream proximity | 346 acres disturbed |

While exposure is increased with “A” mitigations are still effective & effects will be negligable

***FISHERIES***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| No fishery affected | No fishery affected |

***WILDLIFE***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| 447 acres of reduced security cover | 346 acres of reduced security cover |

Hiding cover in the HCP not well defined and could be made an issue

***SOILS***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| 447 acres disturbance | 346 acres disturbance |

While there is greater disturbance with “A” effective mitigations are in place.

***ECONOMICS***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| 3314 MBF available with an expected revenue of $13.86 per ton based on a $400 per thousand on a delivered log, with an expected total revenue of $307,760 plus FI. | 2575 MBF available with an expected revenue of $16.01 per ton based on a $400 per thousand on a delivered log, with an expected total revenue of $276,285 plus FI. |

The $400 per thousand on a delivered log, is based on a price we would anticipate RY paying to a contractor, though right now they are only paying $385 to local contractors.

There are no contractors in the Bozeman Unit with the equipment to do this job as part of Modified “A”. & while the timber market may change between now and the time this is bid it is unlikely to influence the price local contractors will receive at the mill due to lack of competition. It is unlikely that local contractors will be competitive under Modified Alternative “A”. It is likely that RY Timber would bid on this sale under Modified Alternative “A”, but without competition unless the Conservation License holders were to participate.

If Modified Alternative “A” were selected the minimum bid would have to be established to ensure that we received appropriate consideration in a non-competitive market. When establishing this minimum, we could consider the general timber market since RY Timber is able to access it.

If we were to advertise this sale and it not get bid on I believe that would put us in a weak position for re-advertising and selling the sale.

If we were to initially advertise this sale as Modified Alternative “B” I believe we would have a more competitive bidding pool.

***AIR QUALITY***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| No significant Difference | No significant Difference |

***RECREATION***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| No significant Difference | No significant Difference |

***AESTHETICS***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| Slightly greater aesthetic disturbance | Slightly Less aesthetic disturbance |

With the modification to the visual impact is greater, but the areas of greatest visual effect to the valley are less of a factor.

***TRANSPORTATION***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Modified A | Modified B |
| 2.81 Miles administrative and 6.72 miles debris closed road prism | 2.81 Miles administrative and 6.32 miles debris closed road prism |

Both Alternatives allow us to access our land west of Limestone creek and are identical with the exception of 4 short spur roads to facilitate line operations.

Considerations:

* We didn’t present either Alternative as a preferred Alternative. When asked we said we didn’t have a preferred Alternative. If this was inappropriate this was my mistake.
* The specialist thought both alternatives were viable and met our standards. All Specialist thought Modified Alternative B was the more strongly defensible option.
* We have proudly hung our hat on receiving above market returns on our sales and would like to be in the position to continue.