



EDUCATION INTERIM COMMITTEE 68th Montana Legislature

SENATE MEMBERS

Edith (Eddie) McClafferty
Shannon O'Brien
Daniel Salomon
Russel (Russ) Tempel

HOUSE MEMBERS

Fred Anderson
Moffie Funk
Ed Hill
Sara Novak
Linda Reksten
Tyson Running Wolf

COMMITTEE STAFF

Pad McCracken - Research Analyst
Bethany McDowell James - Secretary
Laura Sankey Keip - Attorney

MINUTES LOG

Joint Meeting with the Education Interim Budget Committee and other Constitutional Education Authorities

September 13, 2022 Room 317 / Zoom
Helena, Montana

Please note: This document is a Minutes Log and provides annotation of the time elapsed between the beginning of the meeting and the time at which the item was presented or discussed, a motion was made, or a vote was taken. The narrative presented here is provided only as a guide to the audio or video recording of the meeting. The official discussion, motion, or vote is available on the audio or video archive of this meeting. The Legislature does not prepare a transcript of the meeting activities. The time designation may be used to locate the referenced discussion on the audio or video recording of this meeting.

Access to an electronic copy of these minutes and the audio or video recording is provided from the Legislative Branch home page at <https://leg.mt.gov>. From the home page, select the "Committees" drop down menu at the top, then select Administrative or Interim, and the appropriate committee. The written minutes log can be located by expanding the accordion menu for the date of the meeting. Links to the audio/video files can be located by selecting the Video/Audio button on the same page, then the "past/current recordings" button. From there, use the calendar to select the date of the meeting you wish to view/listen to. The written Minutes Log, along with links to the audio and video recordings, is listed by meeting date on the interim committee's web page. Each of the Exhibits is linked and can be viewed by clicking on the Exhibit of interest. All Exhibits are public information and may be printed. Please contact the Legislative Services Division at 406-444-3064 for more information.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Rep. Fred Anderson, Vice Chair (R)
Rep. Moffie Funk (D)
Rep. Ed Hill (R)
Rep. Sara Novak (D)
Sen. Shannon O'Brien (D)
Rep. Linda Reksten (R)
Sen. Daniel Salomon (R)
Sen. Russel (Russ) Tempel (R)

MEMBERS EXCUSED:

Sen. Edith McClafferty (D)
Rep. Tyson Running Wolf (D)

MEMBERS ABSENT:

STAFF PRESENT:

Pad McCracken, Research
Analyst

Bethany McDowell James,
Secretary
Laura Sankey Keip, Attorney

AGENDA ([Attachment 1](#))

VISITORS' LIST ([Attachment 2](#))

COMMITTEE ACTION

CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

08:00:57 Rep. David Bedey called the meeting to order at 8:00 AM. The committee secretary took roll.

OPENING REMARKS

08:03:54 Rep. Bedey

REVIEW THE CASE FOR CHANGE AND PRIORITIES FOR STRATEGIC GOALS - Jason Dougal, NCEE

08:06:37 Mr. Dougal ([Exhibit 1](#))

PROFICIENCY-BASED LEARNING - Michelle Exstrom, NCSL

08:31:04 Rep. Bedey

08:32:11 Ms. Exstrom (See exhibit 1)

Committee Questions/Discussion

08:56:41 Sharyl Allen, OPI Deputy Superintendent, commented on Montana efforts in teaching.

08:58:01 Julie Murgel, OPI Chief Program Officer, Department of Education Services

PROFICIENCY-BASED LEARNING continued - Michelle Exstrom, NCSL

09:02:47 Ms. Exstrom (See exhibit 1)

Large Group Discussion on Proficiency-Based Learning

09:04:47 Rep. Bedey commented on laws aimed to facilitate the changes Ms. Exstrom mentioned in her presentation. (See exhibit 1)

09:05:34 Rep. Jones commented on legislation related to proficiency-based learning.

09:07:42 Lance Melton, MTSBA Executive Director ([Exhibit 2](#))

09:08:08 Sen. O'Brien commented on the common goals of the group.

09:09:07 Ms. Allen commented on the requirements of reaching an agreement.

09:11:38 Rep. Funk commented on teacher empowerment.

09:12:48 Madalyn Quinlan, Board of Public Education (BPE), asked Ms. Exstrom about setting expectations for evaluating proficiency.

09:18:02 Mr. Melton commented on delegating power between communities and governments.

09:20:32 Rep. Bedey asked Mr. Melton about a detailed plan.

09:20:50 Rep. Jones commented on a potential model school.

- 09:22:31 Rep. Reksten commented on the requirements for change.
- 09:25:29 Rep. Bedey commented on the rules in place to implement proficiency-based learning. He followed by asking if the current laws were sufficient for implementation.

PROFICIENCY-BASED LEARNING continued - Michelle Exstrom, NCSL

- 09:26:42 Mr. Dougal
- 09:49:38 Ms. Exstrom (See exhibit 1)

Small Group Discussion on Proficiency-Based Learning

- 10:00:45 Small group discussion time.

Large Group Discussion on Proficiency-Based Learning

- 10:05:53 Rep. Anderson commented on the difference in applying curriculum in small and large districts.
- 10:07:05 Rep. Jones commented on the intentions behind meeting with the large group.
- 10:11:03 Dr. Murgel responded to Rep. Jones.
- 10:17:00 Susie Hedalen, BPE, commented on including stakeholders and parents involved in educational decisions.
- 10:19:04 Tim Tharp, BPE, asked Mr. Dougal about involving parents in educational decisions.
- 10:23:16 Tammy Lacey, BPE, commented on the first step of the process to start efforts in proficiency-based learning.
- 10:26:05 Renee Rasmussen, BPE, commented on student engagement requirements for proficiency-based learning.
- 10:28:00 Rep. Novak commented on educational changes related to special education. She followed by asking about requirements for high school student athletes.
- 10:29:43 Ms. Allen responded to Rep. Novak's question.
- 10:30:34 Ms. Exstrom responded to Rep. Novak's question.
- 10:32:30 Rep. Jones commented on the question, "How did they enact the change?"
- 10:35:02 Mr. Dougal wrapped up the first discussion.

RECESS

- 10:38:15 Reconvened at 10:50:09

TRANSFORMING THE TEACHING PROFESSION AND INCREASING RETENTION OF TEACHERS - Michelle Exstrom, NCSL, and Jason Dougal, NCEE

- 10:50:51 Mr. Dougal (See exhibit 1)
- 11:08:07 Ms. Exstrom (See exhibit 1)

Small Group Discussion on the Teaching Profession and Increasing Teacher Retention

- 11:25:12 Small group discussion time.

Large Group Discussion on the Teaching Profession and Increasing Teacher Retention

- 11:31:48 Mr. Dougal asked the group for questions regarding the examples shared in the presentation. (See exhibit 1)
- 11:32:31 Rep. Keogh asked Ms. Exstrom about support in New Mexico for National Board Certification.

11:34:42 Mr. Dougal further responded to Rep. Keogh's question.
11:35:10 Rep. Jones commented on the difference in resources spent on students and those spent on teachers. Rep. Jones asked Mr. Dougal about national approaches that result in increased teacher pay.
11:39:40 Sarah Swanson, Governor's Office, asked the representatives in the room to address the current standards in curriculum and administration management.
11:40:26 Todd Buchanan, Board of Regents, responded to Ms. Swanson's question.
11:42:04 Ms. Allen commented on teacher preparation efforts between OPI and BPE.
11:58:52 Mr. Dougal asked the group about the barriers in advancing the teaching profession.
12:01:34 Rep. Reksten responded to Mr. Dougal by commenting on local authority.
12:02:00 Ms. Exstrom responded to Rep. Reksten's comment.
12:04:37 Rep. Funk commented on the desirability of jobs in education.
12:05:58 Mr. Melton asked Mr. Dougal about the constitutional vision for education.
12:08:41 Rep. Bedey responded to Mr. Dougal's question. He followed by asking about focusing on specific elements in education.
12:10:45 Sen. O'Brien introduced Charles Fox, student representative from BPE.

RECESS

12:11:21 Reconvened at 13:04:08 (1:04pm).

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION - Michelle Exstrom, NCSL, and Jason Dougal, NCEE

13:04:48 Mr. Dougal (See exhibit 1)

13:21:18 Ms. Exstrom

Small Group Discussion on Career and Technical Education (CTE)

13:34:33 Small group discussion time.

Large Group Discussion on Career and Technical Education

13:48:38 Rep. Bedey asked Mr. Dougal about Swiss and Finnish high school student statistics. Rep. Bedey followed by commenting on Montana student goals and expectations regarding apprenticeships.
13:49:43 Ms. Exstrom responded to Rep. Bedey.
13:51:58 Rep. Bedey asked Ms. Exstrom about introducing students to potential career pathways before entering high school.
13:54:30 Sen. O'Brien asked to define the difference between registered apprenticeships and project-based learning.
13:55:23 Ms. Exstrom responded to Sen. O'Brien.
13:55:55 Ms. Swanson commented on registered apprenticeship programs at the Department of Labor.
13:56:52 Mr. Melton commented on CTE funding.
14:00:59 Rep. Novak commented on exit requirements for some districts. She followed by asking about state line barriers for student internships.
14:03:23 Ms. Exstrom responded to Rep. Novak.
14:03:35 Rep. Hill asked about employer payment for students in Switzerland. He followed by asking about apprenticeships in other states.

14:04:50 Mr. Dougal responded to Rep. Hill's question.
14:06:58 Ms. Swanson commented on student payments in work-based programs.
14:11:20 Rep. Funk asked Mr. Dougal about the perception regarding professions that don't require a 4-year degree.
14:14:26 Mr. Fox commented on support for CTE programs in Montana schools.
14:16:32 Ms. Flynn commented on rural school support for CTE programs.
14:19:50 Ms. Exstrom responded to Ms. Flynn's comments.
14:20:58 Rep. Jones commented on course-equivalency programs.
14:21:24 Mr. Melton responded to Rep. Jones.
14:22:10 Dr. Murgel commented on the individual who designed the program implemented in New Mexico.
14:22:40 Sen. Tempel commented on positive changes in the education system.
14:24:03 Mr. Tharp commented on the priority requirements for individuals in the education system.
14:24:59 Ms. Lacey commented on CTE program recognition.
14:25:32 Mr. Dougal commented on creating flexible options for students.

EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION - Michelle Exstrom, NCSL, and Jason Dougal, NCEE

14:26:27 Mr. Dougal (See exhibit 1)
14:44:14 Ms. Exstrom

Small Group Discussion on Early Childhood Education

14:57:21 Small group discussion time.

Large Group Discussion on Early Childhood Education

15:09:18 Mr. Dougal introduced discussion on the topic.
15:09:29 Rep. Jones commented on early education studies on pre-k. He followed by asking about studies that claim pre-k to be unfounded.
15:12:30 Ms. Exstrom responded to Rep. Jones.
15:13:24 Rep. Jones asked Mr. Dougal about studies that show a fade-out of things learned in pre-k.
15:17:07 Sen. Tempel asked Mr. Dougal about a study regarding students who are chronically absent in school.
15:19:26 Mr. Melton commented on the choice between private and public schools.
15:20:29 Rep. Bedey commented on public policy to establish a metric for success.
15:21:39 Ms. Exstrom responded to Rep. Bedey's comments.
15:24:53 Mr. Dougal responded to Rep. Bedey's comments.
15:25:50 Jane Hamman, BPE, asked Mr. Dougal about funding for a book-per-month program in Pennsylvania.
15:26:57 Ms. Hamman commented on libraries being involved in schools.
15:27:53 Sen. Morigeau asked Mr. Dougal about efforts to combat absenteeism.
15:31:38 Rep. Jones asked Mr. Dougal about different models of early education.
15:34:10 Ms. Allen responded to Rep. Jones' question.
15:37:01 Ms. Exstrom responded to Rep. Jones' question.

- 15:38:38 Ms. Lacey shared her small group's discussion points. She followed by commenting on setting benchmarks that inhibit growth in education.
- 15:41:28 Ms. Exstrom responded to Ms. Lacey.
- 15:42:02 Rep. Reksten commented on benchmarks that record student successes.
- 15:47:43 Ms. Lacey commented on flexibility options for school districts.
- 15:48:42 Ms. Rasmussen commented on school districts that send kids home with learning tools.
- 15:50:00 Rep. Hill shared his small group's discussion points.
- 15:51:39 Rep. Keogh shared her small group's discussion points.
- 15:54:01 Ms. Exstrom responded to Rep. Keogh.
- 15:55:44 Mr. Melton commented on student enrollment under the age of five.
- 15:58:39 Rep. Bedey responded to Mr. Melton's comments.
- 16:00:22 Rep. Funk shared her small group's discussion points.
- 16:01:46 Rep. Reksten commented on the potential use of Title I funds.

THE PATH FORWARD

- 16:02:49 Rep. Bedey introduced discussion on how to utilize the things that have been discussed.
- 16:09:56 McCall Flynn, Director, BPE, commented on the partnership between the members at the meeting. She followed by responding to Rep. Bedey's comments.
- 16:11:19 Ms. Lacey commented on potential action that can be taken to move forward.
- 16:11:24 Mr. Tharp commented on moving forward with the case for change.
- 16:12:58 Supt. Elsie Arntzen, OPI, commented on equalizing partnerships.
- 16:18:18 Clayton Christian, Commissioner of Higher Education, commented on the discussion's relevancy to higher education.
- 16:21:35 Brianne Rogers, Board of Regents, commented on the partnership between the members at the meeting.
- 16:22:20 Ms. Swanson commented on efforts to provide students additional flexibility options. She also commented on improving data modernization.
- 16:26:44 Mr. Melton commented on the uniqueness of the meeting. He followed by commenting on the work of the members of MTSBA.
- 16:29:14 Scott Walter, MTSBA, commented on the challenges facing the school districts and the required efforts to resolve them.
- 16:30:37 Luke Muszkiewicz, MTSBA, commented on the challenges facing the education system.
- 16:35:00 Rep. Jones commented on the efforts of the group and the possibilities for the education system.
- 16:38:11 Sen. O'Brien commented on responsibility of the members of the group.
- 16:40:40 Sen. Salomon commented on the work of the group.

Public Comment on any topic within EDIC/EIBC jurisdiction

- 16:42:01 Dennis Parman, Montana Rural Education Association
- 16:43:45 Rob Watson, School Administrators of Montana
- 16:52:12 Kelly Creswell, Reach Higher Montana ([Exhibit 3](#))
- 16:53:08 Jenny Murnane Butcher, Self

16:56:54 Diane Fladmo, Montana Federation of Public Employees
16:59:47 Tom Redmon, Self
17:03:14 Caitlyn Jensen, ZeroToFive Montana ([Exhibit 4](#))
17:07:29 Henry Kriegel, Americans for Prosperity
17:09:50 Rachel Wanderscheid, Montana Afterschool Alliance
17:13:58 Stacy Dingman, Self
17:20:16 Gary Lusin, Self

CLOSING REMARKS

17:24:07 Rep. Bedey

ADJOURNMENT

17:27:09 Rep. Bedey adjourned the meeting at 17:27:09 (5:27pm).