Megan Moore

STUDENT SCHOLARSHIP ORGANIZATION CREDIT

EXPLANATION OF CREDIT

The student scholarship organization credit is a credit for donations made to a charitable organization that uses revenue from donations to provide scholarships for students to enroll with a qualified education provider.

The credit may be claimed by an individual or a corporation and is equal to 100% of the donation amount up to a maximum of \$200,000 per taxpayer. Married taxpayers may each claim the credit. Unused credit may be carried forward for 3 years.

Aggregate tax credits are limited to \$1 million in 2022 and \$2 million in 2023. If 80% of the limit is reached in 2023, the limit for 2024 must be increased by 20%. The increased limit then becomes the new base year and the subsequent year's limit is increased if the 80% threshold is met.

Student scholarship organizations registered \$1 million in donations, the 2022 limit, by Jan. 19, 2022.¹

The student scholarship organization credit terminates on Dec. 31, 2029.

REQUIREMENTS RELATED TO STUDENT SCHOLARSHIPS

The student scholarship organizations that receive donations eligible for the credit must:

- be tax-exempt 501(c)(3) organizations;
- use at least 90% of revenue from donations for scholarships to allow students to enroll with any qualified education provider;
- may not reserve scholarships for use at a particular education provider and must allow a student receiving a scholarship to enroll with any qualified education provider.

¹ "Stats," Student Scholarship Organization Tax Credit, available from: https://svc.mt.gov/dor/educationdonation2/Pages/Reports/PublicStats?dt=SSO, accessed Feb. 18, 2022.

A qualified education provider is not a public school or a home school and must:

- be accredited, have applied for accreditation, or be provisionally accredited by a state, regional, or national accreditation organization, or be a nonaccredited provider or tutor that has informed the child's parents in writing that the provider is not accredited and is not seeking accreditation;
- satisfy health and safety requirements for private schools; and
- qualify under state law for an exemption from compulsory enrollment.

To qualify for a scholarship eligible for a tax credit, a student must be a Montana resident between the ages of 5 and 19.

PURPOSE & LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

PURPOSE OF CREDIT IS TO PROVIDE CHOICE

The purpose of the student scholarship organization credit is outlined in 15-30-3101:

15-30-3101. (Temporary) Purpose. Pursuant to 5-4-104, the legislature finds that the purpose of student scholarship organizations is to provide parental and student choice in education with private donations through tax replacement programs.

CREDIT AMENDED ONCE SINCE 2016

The Legislature amended the student scholarship organization credit once since its enactment in 2016. HB 279 (2021) revised both the tax credit – by significantly increasing the maximum credit and allowing the credit to be carried forward – and requirements for student scholarships. The credit was due to expire in 2023 but HB 279 extended the termination to 2029. The following table summarizes the 2021 legislative changes.



STUDENT SCHOLARSHIP ORGANIZATION CREDIT CHANGES, 2021

	2016-2021	2022 and After
Maximum Credit	\$150	\$200,000
Carry Forward	No	3 years
Aggregate Credit Limit	\$3 million	2022: \$1 million
		2023: \$2 million
		2024 and after: \$2 million, with growth factor
Termination	2023	2029
	Scholarship Chang	es
Testing requirement	Qualified education provider required to administer nationally recognized standardized assessment test or criterion test	No testing required
Scholarship limit	 50% of per-pupil average of total school expenditures Average scholarship not to exceed 30% of per-pupil average of total school expenditures 	 Per-pupil average of total school expenditures (\$13,380 for FY21) Removes average scholarship requirement

TAXPAYER USE OF CREDIT

CREDIT CAP NOT REACHED BEFORE 2022 CREDIT INCREASE

Between 2016 and 2020², student scholarship organization credits claimed were far less than the \$3 million aggregate credit limit.

Individual taxpayers claimed the entire \$80,066 in credit; no corporations claimed a credit for a donation to a student scholarship organization.³ Information on whether the taxpayers claiming the credit are residents, non-

³ In the April 14, 2020, "Annual Report on Student Scholarship Organization Credit," Aaron McNay indicates that a corporation did claim the student scholarship organization credit in 2017. The Department of Revenue determined the claim of the credit was a typo and confirmed that no corporations claimed the credit between 2016 and 2020. Email from Aaron McNay, March 15, 2022.



² Data on tax credits claimed for tax year 2021 is not yet available because those tax returns are currently being filed. Donation data for 2021 provided by the Department of Revenue indicates that 2021 donations totaled \$2,600.

residents, or part-year residents is not provided because there were few non-residents and part-year residents claiming credits.

STUDENT SCHOLARSHIP ORGANIZATION PROGRAM CREDITS CLAIMED, 2016-2020

	Montana Student Scholarship Education Credit										
	Number of Returns	Total Number of	Average Credit								
Tax Year	Claiming The Credit	Credits Claimed	Claimed								
2016	188	\$32,129	\$171								
2017	175	\$28,482	\$163								
2018	75	\$11,651	\$155								
2019	12	\$1,563	\$130								
2020	44	\$6,241	\$142								
Total	494	\$80,066	\$162								

Source: Department of Revenue

RELATED CREDIT LITIGATION MAY HAVE AFFECTED CREDIT USAGE

The bill enacting the student scholarship organization credit was the subject of litigation filed in 2016 and ultimately decided by the U.S. Supreme Court in 2020. Uncertainty about the credit's future may have affected donations and credits during the litigation period.

BIG SKY SCHOLARSHIPS RECEIVED MOST DONATIONS BEFORE 2022

For tax years 2016 through 2020, the only registered student scholarship organization was Big Sky Scholarships. In tax year 2021, both Big Sky Scholarships and ACE Scholarships collected donations. Of the \$2,600 in 2021 donations, Big Sky Scholarships received \$2,000 and ACE Scholarships collected \$600.4

DONATIONS SUGGEST LARGER CREDITS TO BE CLAIMED IN 2022

Donations to student scholarship organizations in 2022 reached the \$1 million limit after 13 days. This indicates that \$1 million of tax credits could be claimed when taxpayers file their 2022 tax returns. However, some taxpayers may not have sufficient tax liability to claim the full donation amount and may carry forward the credit for up to 3 years.

⁴ Department of Revenue data on education portal donations, 2016-2021, provided via email from Tony Zammit, Feb. 22, 2022.



Seven student scholarship organizations received the 69 donations totaling \$1 million. Sixty individuals donated \$880,000, and 9 corporations gave an additional \$120,000. The average individual donation was \$14,667 and the average corporation donation was \$13,333. The following table shows the donations received by each organization⁵.

STUDENT SCHOLARSHIP ORGANIZATIONS RECEIVING DONATIONS, 2022

	Number of donations	Total donations	Average donation
ACE Scholarships	24	\$486,300	\$20,263
Missoula Catholic Schools Foundation	15	\$352,200	\$23,480
St. Matthew's Catholic School	19	\$69,000	\$3,632
Holy Spirit Catholic School	4	\$61,000	\$15,250
St. Mary's Catholic School	2	\$12,5 00	\$6,250
Intermountain Children's Services	2	\$12,000	\$6,000
The Way Christian School	3	\$7,000	\$2,333
Total	69	\$1,000,000	\$14,492

ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

ARPA SAVINGS CLAUSE AIMS TO PREVENT LOSS OF FEDERAL FUNDS

The 2021 Legislature included language in <u>HB 279</u> and other bills that reduced taxes or increased tax credits to prevent the potential loss of federal funds available to states through the American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA). The bills include a contingent termination that rolls back the changes if the director of the Office of Budget and Program Planning determines that the amended laws would result in a reduction of federal funds or require the state to repay funds received.

If the contingent termination is triggered, the changes to the aggregate credit limit and to scholarship and qualified education provider requirements would remain in law. The only portions of the law that would terminate are the increase in the credit amount to \$200,000, and the ability to carry the credit forward for 3 years.

⁵ "Stats," Student Scholarship Organization Tax Credit, available from: https://svc.mt.gov/dor/educationdonation2/Pages/Reports/PublicStats?dt=SSO, accessed Feb. 18, 2022.



AGENCY INPUT ON ADMINISTRATION OF CREDIT PROVISIONS

This section discusses administrative issues raised by agencies involved in administering the credit.

The Department of Revenue raised one concern about the credit explained in the following scenario involving passthrough entities making donations eligible for the credit. The maximum credit a taxpayer may claim is \$200,000 beginning in 2022 and there is a \$1 million cap on total credits claimed in that year.

Scenario: A taxpayer has multiple pass-through entities. The taxpayer gets preapproved for an individual donation and donations by pass-throughs that exceed the \$200,000 per taxpayer limit. The \$1 million aggregate limit is reached for the year and no more donations are allowed.

The taxpayer files a tax return claiming a credit in excess of \$200,000 based on donations by the individual taxpayer and by pass-throughs in which the taxpayer has an ownership interest. Student scholarship organizations receive the preapproved donations. DOR should catch this error when the tax return is filed. However, other taxpayers wishing to claim the credit may be prevented from doing so because the aggregate limit was reached based on donations that are later determined not to qualify for the credit.

DOR plans to address this concern in administrative rules, but the committee may wish to clarify in statute that an individual taxpayer is subject to the maximum credit amount even if multiple pass-through entities, trusts, or estates in which the taxpayer has an ownership interest make donations.



STATE SCHOLARSHIP TAX CREDIT PROGRAMS

Twenty-one states have state scholarship tax credit programs. Unless indicated otherwise, the summary information contained in the table below is from Ed Choice's <u>Tax-Credit Scholarships website</u>.

State	Credit Name	Credit Amount	Maximun	n Credit	Carry- forward	Aggregate Limit	Use of funds
			Ind.	Business			
AL	Tax Credit for Contributions to Scholarship Granting Organizations	100%	\$50,000, not to exceed 50% of tax liability	50% of tax liability	3 years ⁶	\$30 million	Scholarships for students who qualify for federal free and reduced-price lunch program (FRL) and zoned to attend a public school designated as failing
AZ	Individual Income Tax Credit Scholarship Program	100%	\$611 Single \$1,221 MFJ	N/A	5 years ⁷	None	Scholarships for K-12 students or preschool students with disabilities
	Low-Income Corporate Income Tax Scholarship Program	100%	N/A	No maximum	5 years ⁸	\$135 million	Scholarships for students with family income of 185% or less of income qualifying for FRL
	Lexie's Law for Disabled and Displaced Students Tax Credit Scholarship Program	100%	N/A	No maximum	5 years ⁹	\$6 million	Scholarships for students with special needs and those in foster care
	Switcher Individual Income Tax Credit Scholarship Program	100%	\$608 single \$1,214 MFJ ¹⁰	N/A	5 years ¹¹	None	Scholarships for K-12 students or preschool students with disabilities

⁶ The Code of Alabama, Section 16-6D-9.

⁷ Arizona Revised Statutes, <u>43-1089</u>.

⁸ Arizona Revised Statutes, <u>20-224.06</u>.

⁹ Arizona Revised Statutes, <u>20-224.07</u>.

¹⁰ Must first make max donation for individual income tax credit scholarship program

¹¹ Arizona Revised Statutes, <u>43-1089.03</u>.

State	Credit Name	Credit Amount	Maximum Credit		Carry- forward	Aggregate Limit	Use of funds
			Ind.	Business			
AR	Philanthropic Investment in Arkansas Kids Scholarship Program	100%	No maximum	n	3 years ¹²	\$2 million	Scholarships for students with family income up to 200% of federal poverty level (FPL)
FL	Florida Tax Credit Scholarship Program	100%	N/A	No maximum	10 years ¹³	\$873.6 million	Scholarships for students with family income up to 375% of FPL (priority given to families with 185% or less) or in foster care
	Hope Scholarship Program	100%	\$105/vehicle		N/A	None	Purchasers of motor vehicles can donate sales tax to provide scholarships to victims of bullying and violence in public schools
GA	Qualified Education Expense Tax Credit	100%	\$1,000 Single \$1,250 MFS \$2,500 MFJ	75% of tax liability	5 years (corps only) ¹⁴	\$100 million	Scholarships for K-12 students
IA	School Tuition Organization Tax Credit	75%	No maximun	ı	5 years ¹⁵	\$20 million	Scholarships for students with family income that does not exceed 400% of FPL
IL	Invest in Kids Program	75%	\$1 million		5 years	\$75 million	Scholarships for students with family income that does not exceed 300% of FPL
IN	School Scholarship Tax Credit	50%	No maximum		9 years ¹⁶	\$18.5 million	Scholarships for students with family income that does not exceed 300% of income qualifying for FRL

State of Arkansas, 93rd General Assembly, Regular Session 2021, <u>Senate Bill 680</u>.
 Florida Statutes, <u>1002.395</u>
 Qualified Education Expense Tax Credit form
 Iowa Code 2022, <u>Section 422.11S</u>.
 June Code 2022, <u>Section 422.11S</u>.

¹⁶ Indiana Code, <u>Section 6-3.1-30.5-9.5</u>.

State	Credit Name	Credit Amount	Maxim	Maximum Credit		Maximum Credit		Maximum Credit		Aggregate Limit	Use of funds
			Ind.	Business							
KS	Tax Credit for Low Income Students Scholarship Program	70%	\$500,000		Yes ¹⁷	\$10 million	Scholarships for students with family income that does not exceed 100% of income qualifying for FRL				
LA	Tuition Donation Credit Program	100%	No maximi	No maximum		None	Scholarships for students with family income of 250% or less of FPL				
MT	Student Scholarship Organization Credit	100%	\$200,000		3 years ¹⁹	2022: \$1 million 2023: \$2 million 2024 and after: \$2 million, with growth factor	Scholarships for students to enroll with a qualified education provider				
NH	Education Tax Credit Program	85%	\$600,000		5 years ²⁰	\$5.1 million	Scholarships for private school, tutoring, online learning, college classes, or homeschooling expenses for students with family income of 300% or less of FPL				

¹⁷ No limit on number of years for carryforward. Kansas Statutes Annotated, <u>Section 72-4357</u>.

¹⁸ RS 47:6301.

¹⁹ "General Information on the Invest in Kids Act," Illinois Department of Revenue, accessed March 25, 2022.

²⁰ New Hampshire Statutes, <u>Section 77-G:4</u>.

State	Credit Name	Credit Amount	Maximun	n Credit	Carry- forward	Aggregate Limit	Use of funds
			Ind.	Business			
NV	Nevada Educational Choice Scholarship Program	100%	N/A	No maximum	5 years	\$14.235 million	Scholarships for students with family income of 300% or less of FPL
ОН	Ohio Tax-Credit Scholarship Program	100%	\$750	N/A	No	None	Scholarships for K-12 students with priority given to low-income families
OK	Oklahoma Equal Opportunity Education Scholarships	50% (75% for same contribution for 2 years)	\$1,000 Single \$2,000 MFJ	\$100,000	3 years ²¹	\$25 million	Scholarships for students with family income of 300% or less of FPL or that attend a public school designated as "in need of improvement"
PA	Opportunity Scholarship Tax Credit Program	75% (90% for same contribution for 2 years)	N/A	\$750,000	No ²²	\$55 million	Scholarships for students with family income below \$96,676 plus \$17,017 for each child
	Educational Improvement Tax Credit Program					\$175 million	Grants to public schools, charter schools, and private schools for innovative educational programs
RI	Tax Credits for Contributions to Scholarship Organizations	75% (90% for 2 years if second year's donation is 80% of first year's)	N/A	\$100,000 (may not exceed minimum tax)	No ²³	\$1.5 million	Scholarships for students with family income of less than 250% of FPL

 ^{21 68} O.S. Section 2357.206 (OSCN 2022), Oklahoma Equal Opportunity Scholarship Act.
 22 FYs 2021 and 2022 only: 2-year carryforward. 24 P.S. Section 20-2006-B.
 23 Rhode Island General Laws, Section 44-62-5.

State	Credit Name	Credit Amount	Maximun	n Credit	Carry- forward	Aggregate Limit	Use of funds
			Ind.	Business			
SC	Educational Credit for Exceptional Needs Children Fund	100%	75% of tax lia	bility	3 years ²⁴	\$12 million	Scholarships for students with disabilities
SD	Partners in Education Tax Credit Program	100%	N/A	Insurance corps. only, excludes fire premium and worker's compensation	No	\$2 million	Scholarships for students with family income of 150% or less of income qualifying for FRL
UT	Special Needs Opportunity Scholarship Program	100%	No maximum	N/A	3 years ²⁵	\$5.9 million	Scholarships for students with special needs
VA	Education Improvement Scholarships Tax Credit Program	65%	\$125,000	No maximum	5 years ²⁶	\$25 million	Scholarships for students with family income of less than 300% of FPL

²⁴ South Carolina Code of Laws, <u>Section 12-6-3790</u>.
²⁵ Utah Code, <u>Section 59-10-1041</u>.
²⁶ Code of Virginia, <u>Section 58.1-439.26</u>.

POSSIBLE TOPICS FOR COMMITTEE FOLLOW UP

The <u>tax credit review worksheet</u> is intended to assist the committee in the tax credit review process. The committee may wish to work through the worksheet to determine next steps.

Possible topics for committee follow up are included throughout this document. They are also summarized below:

DOR plans to address this concern in administrative rules, but the committee may wish to clarify in statute that an individual taxpayer is subject to the maximum credit amount even if multiple pass-through entities, trusts, or estates in which the taxpayer has an ownership interest make donations.